

## **Christianity and the State in Post War Taiwan**

**Murray A. Rubinstein,**

**Weatherhead East Asian Institute, Columbia University**

### **I. Introduction**

The grand question focused upon at this conference is one that has haunted the Chinese state and its peoples over the millennia. It is this: What has been—and now is --- the nature of the relationship between the imperial/governmental system and China's many religious bodies and traditions.

While most essays focused on one or more of these traditions and their interaction with the state in China—Imperial, Republic, Communist or the totalitarian command state we now find, I focus upon Taiwan, the island with its own unique and problematic history that lies on hundred miles east of Fujian along the South China coast. I also focused upon a period that began in 1945, when the Japanese surrendered the island that had become under their fifty years of control a modernized colony and the jewel of their short lived imperium to the Republic of China . I focus on one of those alien religions that the Qing state had branded as heterodox and forbidden and had to be forced to accept its very entry into and then promulgation in China only through military pressure by key western in the years after the First Opium War—Christianity.

In Section I, I introduce a spectrum that allows us to see where Taiwan's churches stand in their relationship with the state. This theological/political map allows us to better understand what impact this relatively small community of Christians writ- large-i.e. Catholics , Protestants, and Mormons who are not truly Christian but a quasi-Christian "ne religion (as most American evangelicals---and your author--believe ) has had in the development of Taiwan's religious consciousness and the evolution of its democratic socio-political and economic and cultural systems and on the development of the larger, Chinese religio-cultural systems that one finds on the island. In this same section I place each major church and some smaller ones into their place—as I see it, on the church state spectrum.

### **Section I. The Taiwanese Church/ State Spectrum Defined**

Why create a spectrum of church/state relations? My first answer is a distinctly personal ( or some might say, egocentric one) . In the past, when I was working on my monograph, *The Protestant Community on Modern Taiwan* and more recently when I wrote "Going back to Church", my long, long profile of the Taiwanese Community, I developed two spectrum that located churches on Taiwan in terms of a mainline to evangelical spectrum and another in terms of missionary –connected to independent to indigenous spectrum . In another essay

on issues of religion and modernization, I developed yet a third spectrum—this one on the relationship of religion and modernization on Taiwan. Here I used the device of the spectrum once again as a means of dealing with the issue of church and state in modern Taiwan.

I make use of the mode/device/analogy that is the spectrum, borrowing of an important device that scholars of optics such as Newton made use of—the prism—a simple triangle of clear glass or crystal that has the ability to break sunlight into its basic colors. Scholars in the physical and social sciences have adapted this concept of a range of colors to their own uses. Thus the concept of spectrum is utilized to describe the placement of everything from the nature of political party membership to states of psychological well-being and adjustment ---normal to abnormal, to attitudes toward music, to types of golf clubs people use on the course (a rather arcane spectrum, but one I know all too well in my other role as a historian and collector of and user of golf sets). Here, as I suggested, I use the spectrum model to define the way the churches of Taiwan place themselves in relationship to the governmental authorities on Taiwan.

#### **Section IV. 1. The Spectrum Spelled out and “Illustrated: Taiwan’s Christian Communities and Where they Fit**

The church/state spectrum I present here is divided into three sections or segments. The first, on the far right, consists of those churches and missions that align themselves and have solid and strong relations—and at times work with the ROC government and its leaders. The second or middle section of the S/CS (State/Church Spectrum) contains churches that attempt to remain neutral and exist, as much as possible as agents who have as little to do with the state apparatus as much as they can. They follow what might be called the American model of strict church state separation. The third section of spectrum, on the left is made of those churches that were and , for some , still are critical of the KMT state. They are suspicious of the objectives of the state and its policies and challenge it in print and in public venues .At times they also criticize the State through statements to the US public or to the World Council of Churches which is often sympathetic to them and their cause of greater religious freedom and less state interference. The years from 1945 to the near present show those of us of a more human rights orientation and a more liberal or Progressive political orientation that such criticisms were valid on many occasions. In the pages ahead I fill in the details and place a number of the churches that that make up its Christian and quasi Christian communities in what I see is their proper—or most logical place in the C/SS.

I begin with the right section of the spectrum. That spectrum segment—or spectrum space is inhabited by those church bodies that are aligned with the KMT

government and its various philosophical/ ideological concepts and viewpoints and the governmental policies—at home and abroad that are based on these ideological/philosophical clusters.

I must add that these perspectives did not exist in a void. By 1951, the ROC was again an American client and savvy government ideologues—and technocrats knew that they had to win over key member of the American populace to be able to insure ongoing American support. A basic list of the talking points to key American pressure groups were that the ROC was strongly anti-Communist and was also while still a command economy/corporatist state a state willing to become over time a nation with a free-market economy—and a place that would welcome American businessmen and American FDI—foreign Direct Investment. The right section of the spectrum was made of up a number of churches whose leaders and members supported these more politically “conservative” viewpoints.

Perhaps the best representative of the churches of this kind was the Southern Baptist Convention so let us start here.

#### **Section IV. 2. The Pro-ROC Government Zone of the Spectrum: The Southern Baptist Convention**

One of the first of these mission bodies was the Southern Baptist Convention. As its own mission history shows us, it was a major player first in South China and then beyond in a missionary presence that began in the years before the first Opium War. As a number of scholars have shown us, primarily Jonathan Spence in his magisterial, *God's Chinese Son*, while American Board missionaries gave him Christian tracts, it was missionaries working for SBC, such as Issachar Shuck, who educated him and made him a member. All of this resulted in a set of dramatic and ultimately destructive consequences that no one could have imagined.<sup>1</sup>

The Southern Baptists established themselves in Taipei and developed a network of churches that spread out into the suburbs. The church did grow among the mainlander community and in the 1950s the Southern Baptist bought land in what was a rural corner in the most southeastern section of the city and built seminary complex there. Little did they realize that in nearby hills were the graves of Taiwanese and mainlanders who had died at the hands of the KMT regime in its earliest and most paranoid and brutal years. Over the course of the last year, Linda Arrigo, now a professor at the Taiwan Medical University has worked with students to find these graves of the victims of the White Terror.” I find there is a sad irony of this overlapping of holy space and killing grounds—or, more precisely burial grounds of those the state wished to eliminate in the early 1950s.

The SBC did not expand its evangelization to the Taiwanese community and this proved fatal to their hopes for expansion of church membership. On the dates that followed would church leaders realize their error. (start)

### **Section IV.3. The Pro-ROC Government Zone of the Spectrum: The Roman Catholic Church**

In 1859, the Roman Catholic Church came back to Taiwan, an island they had been driven from during the era of Dutch East India control in the early 17<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>2</sup> A second wave of Catholic missionaries ( Spanish Dominicans who were based in the Philippines ) moved to Fujian during the early Treaty Port Era and from there came to the southern Taiwanese cities of Gaoxiong and Tainan in 1859, after the Treaties of Tianjin and Beijing had opened the way for a larger missionary Presence. For the next three decades these missionaries represented were part of the Fujian Apostolic Vicariate. That vicariate was divided into the Northern (Fuzhou) and Southern (Amoy (Xiamen) vicariates and Taiwan was a part of the Southern Vicariate until July of 1913 when it became separate. Of course, this was a Taiwan that was no long a part of China: in 1895 it had become of colony of Imperial Japan by the terms of the treaty that ended the Sino-Japanese

War. Two Spanish prefects apostolic served on the island led the church (first Monsignor Clemente Fernandez and then Monsignor Tomas de la Hoz) until they, like the Presbyterian missionaries were driven from the island by hyper- imperialist Japanese administrators in 1940.<sup>3</sup>

Once the Second Sino-Japanese and the larger conflict, World War II was over and the Japanese surrendered the island to the ROC government, Rev. Tu Min-chen, a Taiwanese priest was appointed minister of the Taiwanese prefecture. However , Western missionaries began to return to their respective churches Catholic, Presbyterian and Holiness, but the nature of their roles in the Taiwanese church community depended on what churches they were in. Taiwanese Presbyterians made it clear that they were in control and that the missionaries would have to serve as advisors. They rewrote church bylaws to formalize this process as a number of church historians such as the former British Presbyterian, Elizabeth Brown has shown us in her Oxford MA thesis on the history of the Taiwanese church she had served for many years. She served as one of those western advisors (as the Assistant General Secretary) in the critical decade of the 1970s and early 1980s work with the head of the church pastor Gao Zhun-min.

The Catholic hierarchy was not ready to follow the Presbyterian lead (and are not yet ready to this day, in any real way) and on March 5 of 1948, Jose Arregui OP (check—Philippino) was appointed the new prefect of Taiwan. Two



year later, after the ROC control of the Chinese mainland ended and many Catholic priests and lay people migrated to Taiwan, Rome decided to divide Taiwan into two prefectures. One, Westerner (Spanish), Arrgeui was again was given the reins of leadership in Gaxiong and a Chinese pastor, Joseph Kuo CDD was appointed for the post of Prefect of Taipei. At the same time a prefecture was established in Taizhong. . William F. Kupfer, MM, a Maryknoll missionary was made head of the Taizhong prefecture two years later. The Maryknoll order had done important work in Fujian and many of its priests and nuns came to Taiwan and were based at first in Taizhong. The Maryknoll Chapterhouse is still there and very active to this day.

These were but the first steps taken and as the 1950s went on personnel were added as Roman Catholic membership continued to increase. What must be noted is that during Retrocession it was the order Spanish Dominicans who played the largest role and as years went on and the pool of missionary talent and regular parish style priests were needed to man the new congregations. The order's role was diminished.

Among the Catholic missionary order, the Jesuits ,worked with the immigrants from Mainland China. The American priests in that order, I discovered during the year I taught in the Graduate faculty at Furen Catholic University, were political conservative and were Cold War hardliners. These priests major center

was the Tian Center located near the Tai-Power stop on the MRT, on Roosevelt Road but a few blocks from Taida and the Xinsheng Nan Lu's Church Road district.<sup>4</sup>

A comment on the geography of Christian Taibei is necessary here. The Jesuit Tian Center was a long block away from what I call "Church Road" On the map it is the southern-most stretch of Xinshen Nan Lu . "Church Road" is my own term and it reflects the reality of this area. When one walks down Xinsheng Nan Lu from north of Renai Lu Hoping Lu staying on the west side of that grand thoroughfare that once was a Taibei dividing ditch, one finds church after church—from Methodist to Lutheran to Southern Baptist to Catholic on the western side of the Road. One also finds the grand Taibei Mosque as well. A few short blocks west of Xinsheng Nan Lu and near where it meets Roosevelt Road and end-- is the new seven storey building that serves as headquarters of the PCT. When one adds the Jesuit Tian Center and the Catholic church that is part of that complex and the China Evangelical Seminary a few blocks from the Tian center, on Tingzhou Lu one discovers that the area is dominated, in terms of working sites, at least, as the Christian hub of Taiwan. Let me note, however, that that same area has its share of Buddhist temples and *minjian* temples as well. It is, for you Taibei hands, a few blocks from the night market just south of the sprawling Taida campus that is north of Roosevelt Road.<sup>5</sup>

What Hollington Tong shows us in his important, but forgotten, book of 1961, *Christianity in Taiwan: A History*, is that the Catholic Church, with its fine-honed organizational skills and its very different and able set of missionaries representing different orders, was able to “seize the day” and gather in a larger and larger flock. The Diocesan church and the leadership of that church was primarily mainland in makeup. The SVD, the Brothers of the Divine Word, a German order helping to recreate a Chinese Catholic University, Furen, in a township in Taipei County just west of the city, Zhongli (check) the number of Catholics grew at a rate that challenged that of the PCT. By the early 1960s, the Catholics stood at 170,000 up from 8,000 in the late 1940s. I must add that the number of Protestants had increased as well during this same period, so the immediate post war period was one of dramatic growth.

The half century that followed would prove to be more difficult for the Roman Catholic Church writ large. The expansion was certainly steady if not spectacular as in the late 1940s and the 1950s. What we do see over these decades is institutional growth and a steady process of Sinicization and Taiwanization. Our window to this process of Catholic growth in membership and institutional expansion is a large format soft-covered book that the Taipei Archdiocese prepared and published in the celebration of the 150<sup>th</sup> year of its continuous presence as a religious body on Taiwan.<sup>6</sup>

We must begin with ecclesiology—church organization. In the words of the Profile of the Catholic Church,<sup>7</sup> “The Catholic church is a big family in human society. On the administrative side it is an organization with a system. The detailed rules and regulations of the Catholic Church can be found in the ‘Code of Canon Law’. In general it includes the Pope, the Holy See, bishops , priests, Christian faithful(i.e. Catholic) religious communities (the formal “orders” of the church, many of them evangelical/missionary organizations), and associations of the faithful (usually termed lay organizations). “

There is one Archbishop on Taiwan he is the leader of the Taiwan Roman Catholic Church in Taiwan today (January, 2012) . He is Hung (John) Shan-chuan, the head of the Taibei Archdiocese. He was appointed Archbishop by Pope Benedict in 2007. Taibei is the only archdiocese on the island. The rest are diocese and thus exist on a lower rung of church organization. Taiwan now is made up of the Taibei Archdiocese, and the Jiayi Diocese, the Xinzhu Diocese, the Hualian Diocese, the Gaxiong Diocese, the Taizhong Diocese and the Tainan Diocese. Each of these is head by a bishop who report to Archbishop Shan.

The Taiwanese Catholic educational network is also impressive. Furen is the crown jewel of the system and I came to know it well in the 1879 -1980 school year as a professor there. It was a useful and exciting experience and I enjoyed my fellow instructors company and discussions and comradeship and my students as

well. From what I have gathered from various sources , it remains a strong institution. There are also high schools and lower level schools at various sites throughout the island including Gaoxiang. The PCT has its own network and so church versus church competition for students is as real here as is church versus state run competition.

The Catholics also have networks of clinics and at least one major hospital, St. Josephs . Furthermore some of the orders, most notably Maryknoll, with its Taiwanese constituency have vocational programs of various sorts. What I have presented thus far is a generally positive view of the Roman Catholic Church. There are more critical views that present the church in what can a more realistic than mine. The most important of these is a paper presented at a conference in Ireland in September of 2011. It is by Richard Madsen, a Distinguished Professor of Sociology and Chinese Studies at the University of California/San Diego. The abstract that follows sums up this important paper:

There was a large influx of Chinese and foreign Catholic priests, bishops, and nuns into Taiwan from mainland China in the years immediately following 1949. During the 1950s, there was a subsequent rapid increase in the number of conversions to Catholicism as well as a rapid growth of Catholic institutions. But the conversions tapered off in the early 1960s, and the number of actively practicing Catholics went into a steady decline. Today, many large church buildings in Taiwan are largely empty of Taiwanese on Sundays. If they are filled at all, it is with guest workers from the Philippines. The rapid rise and steep declines were based on a confluence of factors: the socio-political context, internal tensions within the Catholic clergy, and changes in local culture. This case study, based on archives from

the Maryknoll Fathers, has some interesting parallels with the decline of the Catholic Church in Ireland over the past generation. A comparison of the two might contribute to general theories of religious growth and decline.

The paper by Professor Madsen is very rich and very important one that is presented by a scholar who is a classic insider/outsider. Using a variety of sources, including Maryknoll archives and his own personal and hard-won knowledge that was gained as a member of the Maryknoll Mission on Taiwan decades ago, he presents a portrait of the RCC on the rise on Taiwan and then on the decline. The reasons for both the rise and the decline are spelled out clearly and do show, as I suggested earlier in this section on the RCC on Taiwan, that the rosy portrait presented by the 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary volume is exaggerated and does not present the deep and painful truth of Catholic core membership—that it is far, far smaller than the Anniversary volume suggests. Why this is the way it is spelled out in “The Spectacular Growth and Precipitous Decline of the Catholic Church in Taiwan”<sup>8</sup>

But where is the RCC in the grand spectrum? It is, as I suggested earlier, in the right section, the one that contains the churches that are most supportive to the KMT regime. Let me suggest why this is so: The Catholic establishment in Taiwan was largely Waishenren and many had come to Taiwan during the retreat to the island in the late 1940s, when it was clear that the mainland was being lost to the PLA. That body of Chinese were betoken and thus loyal to the KMT-dominated state that had provided them a new home.

The RCC hq in Rome –if I may refer to the Vatican that way-- went so far as to build an Apostolica—an embassy on ground that, as fate would have it, was to be just across the street from the Mormons, aka the Church of the Latter Day Saints tabernacle and offices. There was no love lost between these two very different states, one old and majestic and the other new (a hundred plus years old) and totally schlocky in its grandiose , over the top, style of church construction. That building was a symbol of the strong relationship, at first at least , between the RCC and the KMT state. Though the building was closed up for a host of diplomatic and political reasons, it remains as an odd symbol of RCC support of the little China that Taiwan province has become.

That loyalty remains today and with good reason. Catholicism continues to exist, in all its splendor on Taiwan today and, if the church is not as successful as it wants to presents itself as, it is still a major and highly visible presence on the island and it is a church that is not challenged by the state—as is the case in the PRC.

The loyal RCC is the major church establishment we find in Taipei. One major order, the Maryknollers do not follow that party line of support, however, as we shall discover when we examine the third segment of this spectrum.

## **Section IV.4. The Pro-ROC Government Zone of the Spectrum: The China Evangelical Seminary**

### **The China Evangelical Seminary**

The China Evangelical Seminary is the training ground for pastors and lay workers of the various independent more Evangelical churches that are found primarily in Taipei. The seminary was founded by both Chinese Christians and western missionaries. The first president of the Seminary was Hudson Taylor III, the great grandson of James Hudson Taylor, the founder of the Plymouth Brethren related-China Inland Mission (today, the Overseas Mission Fellowship). As we will see a bit later, the OMF is a powerful actor in the larger Protestant community as heir to the CIM.

The president that followed James Hudson Taylor were Chinese with strong scholarly and church backgrounds. His first successor was Timothy Lin(1911-2009). Timothy Lin had a long and exiting and productive career in the Chinese and ,later, the Taiwanese (or, more accurately, the Waishenren) Protestant community. Let us look at his career.

Lin was a member of an Anglican family from Jejiang and studied at a seminary in Nanjing. According to his biography on Wikipedia, he only went through a deep and formal conversion process when he was nineteen years old. I see this comment in this online biography as strong suggesting that the piece's



author was an Evangelical to whom conversion marks the inner reality of an individual's faith. It is very much a code that those outside the field of Protestant Studies would not necessarily pick up. Lin in did show, the biography's author states that he was a deeply spiritual young man who was also intent on gaining knowledge of the roots and evolution of Christianity and his own church and its rich almost five-century long history. He soon discovered that he was by nature more conservative a Christian than his Anglican family, and disagreed with the liberal tilt of the seminary's approach to studying the Bible. He believed in Binlical inerrancy and the 19<sup>th</sup> century school of textual analysis was too scientific, too accepting of the German school of the historical critical approach. He felt suech and approach and was anti-scriptural—ie against "original meaning." This is akin to the American political right-wing's approach to the United States Constitution. These scholars and justices were intent on finding the original meaning in the America constitution and disregarding much of the a long history of interpretive change through case law and supreme court decisions that relied on interpretation based in the present day realities, not the realities of a mythical founders past. He left the seminary to serve as pastor in various churches, and religious schools working within the Christian and Missionary Alliance, a evangelical body that had its headquarters in Rockland County in New York's Hudson Valley ( your author's home ground). This was during the early years of the Second Sino Japanese war

and during the war lost his wife and children while working in Nanjing. He was able to leave China for America in 1940 he attended Concordia Seminary and the Washington University and received what would be the first and second of a number of degrees in western schools belonging to the well regarded Evangelical and Brethren related wings of western Protestantism. When he returned, his degrees and experience in Christian education provided him with more opportunity and he became dean of the Shanghai Baptist college and after the war was appointed president of the Hangzhou-based East China Theological College. In 1948 he was able to go back to the United States and to obtain Bachelor of Divinity and the Master of Sacred Theology at the Faith Theological Seminary. He then went on to Dropsie College, a Jewish institution and received a Ph.D. in Hebrew and Cognate Language. These years of study in the United States were fortuitous for he did not have to experience the painful final years of the Chinese Civil war.

In the years that followed he pursued a career as a scholar of Christianity in the west working in some of the more conservative religious colleges and seminaries as well as a pastor in more evangelical churches in various parts of the United States. Given his degrees and his own take on the nature of faith and on interpreting the Bible, this was the only practical path he could take.

He was a member of the faculty of Bob Jones College a famous (or infamous) Christian college and then taught at the Talbot School of Theology and

then the Trinity Evangelical Seminary. He proved to be a solid scholar and strong and charismatic lecturer and was seen as an strong representative of the conservative wing of the American Chinese Community. His choice as the second president of the China Evangelical Seminary was a logical choice. I was able to meet with him and found to be an interesting man to interview. I sensed that at the CES he found a perfect home for given his beliefs and his strong education within the Evangelical community. He took his post at CES in 1980, succeeding Hudson Taylor III and remained at the seminary in 1990.<sup>9</sup>

Reverend Lin's successor was Paul Lai He was followed, in 2011 by Peter K. Chow. Each man is a scholar in his own right, with degrees from Westminster Theological and a Ph.D from Temple University.<sup>10</sup> Both of these leaders have worked to keep James Hudson Taylor III's commitment to serious scholarship deep faith alive as they ran and now run CES. Given the new theological realities they are finding on Taiwan, this scholarly emphasis may be challenged as I shall suggest at a later point in this discussion of the CES.

The CES faculty is equally broad based, though OMF people seem to serve the longest continuous tenures. The administration was able to convince missionaries based on Taiwan to serve there and to see the CES as a center for research and scholarship as well religious education and pastoral training. I have been fortunate to work with or interview a number of them since the 1980sThe

CES faculty is equally broad based, though OMF people seem to serve the longest continuous tenures. The administration was able to convince missionaries based on Taiwan to serve there and to see the CES as a center for research and scholarship as well religious education and pastoral training. I have been fortunate to work with or interview a number of them since the 1980s

As I suggested, the CES has hired or made use of the services of some important westerners as well. Alan Swanson was one of this and what follows is a brief portrait of the man and his work, a man who I knew and became both an important and good friend whose life and work I admire, though we see the world and the nature of religion very differently. I see him as mentor who allowed me to learn much about the Christianity community on Taiwan from a very sophisticated scholar and deeply pious and devoted man who came to love Taiwan and his own Lutheran flock and the larger community with a quiet but very deep passion.

I met Allen Swanson in 1983. He had come to Taiwan with the Lutheran church and his own scholarly as well as pastoral sensibilities—and his comfort with the evangelical tradition had made a good fit to teach at the CES. He had by then begun to explore the great problem all missionaries and Taiwanese and Waishen ren Christians, whether pastors or lay leaders faced—how account for and deal with the failure of the Christian community in the ROC, in the face of serious efforts at evangelism and the founding (or planting) of new churches to to

maintain high levels of growth, growth that match the percentage growth of an expanding and ever more sophisticated Taiwanese economy. His three books, *Mainline versus Independent Church Growth*, *the Church in Taiwan: Profile 1980* and *Mending the Nets*,<sup>11</sup> were all contributions to the understanding of the various issues the missionaries and their allies in the Chinese and Taiwanese churches faced.

Swanson was also a man who was aware of larger trends in East Asian Christianity. One such movement was the crusade of the Korean past or a mega church, Paul Chou. In the 1980s he attempted to teach these ideas to Christian workers in the hope that this charismatic movement would take hold. I went with him to a small Christian complex in Miaoli and saw how he was able to get his ideas across and have these Taiwanese Christians promote a charismatic revival on Taiwan. He was an excellent teacher and advocate and the revivals that did occur among various churches were so successful, they scared the leaders of the more liberal and less revival oriented churches. Taiwanese Presbyterians I talked to were wary of the new movements and felt that some of the yuanzhumin churches were involved in such revivals with their explosive “gifts of the Holy Spirit” and were ready to leave the more sober, more structured and more social service oriented churches that the Presbyterians had helped to found and nurture. Swanson was excited by the results he saw and believed that such strong and loud and

emotional revivals were ways of bringing more people into the churches or back to them.<sup>12</sup>

I must add here that I learned something of the power of this Korean Charismatic movement when I attended a meeting of the Society for Pentecostal Studies held in a bible school located near the shore community of Huntington Beach. I had become a friend of the Provost of the Fuller Theological Seminary in Pasadena, a seminary that was shifting from evangelical to Pentecostal forms of Christianity, and my friend was a Pentecostal. He was working with a Korean-American businessman who was closely allied with Paul Chou's church and this man gave me a good sense of the nature of what Paul Chou and his mega church did. I also learned how strong the links and relationships between Korean and American evangelicals and Pentecostals were becoming. I saw this movement as an important and fascinating one and now see it as a early sign of the expansion of East Asian (here Korean) forms of independent Christianity was becoming. I shall deal with this issue of Taiwanese Christian outreach and expansionism in section three. I have mentioned here because it shows how far ahead of the curve Allan Swanson was and much he thought that East Asian forms of emotional, "Holy Spirit Driven forms of Christian might change the dynamics of church life and promote church growth on Taiwan. Here Swanson was at one—was on the same page with my American Pentecostal seminary administrator friend—and a

powerful student of Latin American Pentecostal and Charismatic movements and his Korean-American player and intermediary who helped bring together Korean and American men of religious power and influence.

Swanson was a pastor and church leader who became a scholar and a teacher. There is another individual, another American scholar and pastor, G. Wright Doyle, who also taught at and played an important role in the development of the China Evangelical Seminary and I will now examine, albeit briefly, his interesting career.

Dr. Doyle, now the General Director and a Senior Research Associate at the Global China Center in Virginia. He did undergraduate degree at the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, his M. Div at the Virginia Theological Seminary in Alexandria Virginia, and his Ph.D in Classics at the his undergraduate university, the University of North Carolina. He wrote on Augustine of Hippo, one of the major (magisterial) figures in the theological/doctrinal history of early Catholic/Christian Church. He then moved to Taipei to learn Chinese at the Taipei Language Institute so as to be able to teach at the China Evangelical Seminary and began his work on Mandarin at the Taipei Language Institute. He then became a professor at CES and taught there from 1980 to 1988. He taught courses on the New Testament, Greek, and Ethics. It is fair to say that he came to know Dr. Lin, the then president of CES well. I'm sorry to say I never met him over the years

When he and his family returned to the United States, he became part of the Global China Institute, an evangelically oriented think tank that focuses on the PRC. He is a strong scholar and over the years has gone from more formal scholarship to books on China and on American Christianity and a biography of evangelical leader Carl Henry. He has also written books published in Chinese.

The CES occupies an important place Taiwanese Protestant community. Its students come from a range of smaller evangelical churches and denominations, both Chinese and western. This large umbrella neatly coincides with the CIM/OMF profile for men and women of very different denominations served in it over its more than a century and a half of existence.

I have also been in the position to use the CES as a base during the initial stages of my research on the Protestant community on Taiwan and did interviews of a number of students as well. I made it my business to visit the CES almost each year I was in Taiwan from 1983 to the summer late spring of 2011 and try to talk to faculty and students and obtain various in-house publications. During my last visit I spent a morning there and did interview a member of the western faculty, Andrew Butler who had been at CES since its very beginning.<sup>13</sup>

But what were the reasons for the CES? What students did it serve the and what are they like now? How did CES change over time? What the trends we see



in its development and just what is like now and what role does it play in the life of the larger Christian community. On January 25, 2012, I conducted an interview/dialogue with G. Wright Doyle and over that span of time he helped me to obtain a more clear and precise sense of CES history. Many of the questions I posed are based on his comments and I shall make use of these comments and insights to round out this portrait of CES. I shall also return to G. Wright Doyle and his sense of things in my conclusion.

When the China Evangelical Seminary began it was seen by James Hudson Taylor III as a means of serving churches that did not have access to an evangelical, but not narrow denominational seminary. That idea of Christian community and not separatism was at the heart of the CIM/OMF sensibility. That idea was important to President Taylor. What was also important was scholarship. There was great emotion in the Christians of Taiwan, but there was not the deep knowledge of the Bible and of the history of Christianity that a person needed to reinforce the fact that he was now not only Chinese but something more and that he lived within Chinese civilization and now within a universal Christian culture as well. Thus he worked to bring in faculty that would train pastors and teachers and active and involved lay people who would know their faith as well as feel it and practice it. The presidents who followed Taylor continue this core idea of

making its graduates both intellectuals and deeply sincere and devout members of the evangelical community writ large.

In some ways, Prof. Doyle suggests, the CES did too well. Churches within its umbrellas decided it was a good model to follow and in the next twenty to thirty years build their own denominational seminaries. When the smoke clear there were a number of new seminaries but the one that still lead the way was CES.

In the 2000s , CES and other seminaries have begun to face new challenges. The first is their status in society. They are now beginning to be recognized as educational institutions and their degrees and degree programs have a formal and more viable status. The Master of Divinity is a true Masters degree, now for example. Because they are being given this new status, they have to meet the various regulations and qualifications by the Jyauyubu, the Ministry of Education. One such qualification that has become a game changer is this. Each seminary must have certain number of acres so one can have classrooms, faculty office space, student housing facilities and libraries if certain size and capacity to house books and related materials. This has forced the seminaries, including CES to find new space out side of the central city. This they are doing. The Southern Baptist had done this from the start as had both Synods of the Presbyterian Church on Taiwan. Now a new CES is being born.

Why was this change in status put through. The answer is simple. The government had n the surge of Christianity in China and was aware that Chinese students wanted to obtain theologically related degrees. Taiwan was now going to be the place where they could get that degree and better serve the now one hundred million Chinese Christians.

As all of this began to change, a new challenge appeared. The drive to create a stronger intellectual base was one of James Hudson Taylor III's objectives. The newer faculty, like those of the Taiwan Theological College and Seminary, are better trained in the United States at the major evangelical seminaries such as Fuller and Trinity and Wheaton also at the major Ivy League seminaries, as has been the case of the TTCS. However, the students coming in were not as interested in this strong intellectual and scholarly tradition. They were caught up in the charismatic fervor one saw and the Linyang Tang (a Pentecostal Church) as well as what one saw at the TJC and the Difanghuei. That has begun to create a new culture clash and the faculty and new President of CES, David Hong, a scientist and scholar by training will now have to bridge the divide.

Professor Doyle has given us, as you the reader can see, important insights to the CES. He sees a stronger seminary coming out of this change, a seminary that will meet the needs of the Taiwanese Evangelical community. He remains a player, returning to the seminary each and visiting China as well. He served his school and

his larger community well and his students have come to play an important role in the lives of the church members they work with to this day.

Given its roots in the CIM/Overseas Mission Fellowship with its strong anti-Chinese Communist bias and its work with the evangelical churches with primarily Waishenren membership, it is, in my considered opinion, an organization that is pro KMT and pro-ROC government. It is not willing to go against its student base nor the feelings of the members of the more theologically—and politically conservative churches that it provides pastors and church workers for.

There are those attached or formally attached to the CES who do work in the PRC as below the radar evangelists but those I met were, as I read them as conservative in their political stance as in their theological attitudes.(Start

#### **Section IV.4. The Pro-ROC Government Zone of the Spectrum The Holiness Church**

A second wave of revivalism hit England in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> century. What one saw was the development of a new, Methodist-based religious movement that swept England and the United States—and later China as well. One of the new Methodist based churches was The Holiness Church, a decidedly more evangelical and pietistic version of the Methodists. This is the church that had come to Japan in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century and its missionaries had created a body of believers there. This church later moved, in the 1920s to Taiwan and based itself

in Taizhong in the 1910s. It would later find a rival in yet another church with links to Methodism, their own Holiness movement and the Charismatic/Pentecostal movement born in the United States and moved to China--during that same span of years in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. This was the True Jesus Church, and independent Chinese/Taiwanese church born out the preaching of American Pentecostals in northern China in the second decade of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century.

The Holiness Church that we find on Taiwan today has not grown as much as those missionaries and early Taiwanese members hoped that it would. It was planted by Taiwanese students studying in Japan and these men moved to back to Taiwan in 1926 to the Gaoxiong. Here working with a dynamic Taiwanese leader, Zong Tienjing, they established a church in that Taipei on the major north south thoroughfare of Zhongshan Road and began to establish what grew in a church in numbers. Church members then moved south to Gaoxiong where they established another Holiness congregation, this one on Gaishang Street. Over the course of 1926 and 1927, Pastor Zong evangelized tirelessly, according to the Wikipedia account and a congregation was formed in the southeastern coastal city of Taidong. Zhong then moved back north to the port city of Jilong and in that same year, 1927, he founded yet another congregation of Holiness believers.<sup>14</sup> That pace of development could not continue but over the next three decades, one may assume that steady, if not spectacular progress was made in building the size of the flock. I

must note that the PCT and the TJC were strong rivals with their own well organized churches and methods of evangelism.

While the church did have presence on Taiwan, it seems to be little studied, as I discovered in my own Google search. What I did find is that it has been working with the Overseas Mission Fellowship, the new name of the CIM and has worked with the OMF in a variety of projects. The OMF website contains useful information on its joint effort with this church whose tenure on Taiwan has been long but not all that successful.

My impression is that this church supports the government. It began on Taiwan as a Imperial Japanese-supported church and seems careful in the way it deals with the government.

#### **Section IV. 5. The Pro-ROC Government Zone of the Spectrum: The Assemblies of God**

The Assemblies of God was yet another church that came out the Methodist/Holiness/Brethren tradition. It was a Pentecostal Church whose roots lay in the United States and the grand evangelical/charismatic movement that swept both Black and Caucasian lower and lower middle class communities in the first two decades of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. This rather small Taiwanese church community is related to the largest of the United States based Pentecostal churches that has its denominational headquarters in the Springfield, Missouri. The Assemblies of God

church is part of a large and still active American Denomination that is located, as does the SBC in the southern American heartland. The AOG began and still thinks of itself as the church of the “dispossessed,” though in truth, in this observer’s view it is very much a middle-class, and politically conservative body. Given the right wing flavor of the AG in the United States and the fact that it is a Taipei based mandarin speaking church with Waisheren as its predominant membership, it would seem that its leaders and members supported the KMT and its regime. The paranoia of one member’s opinion of this author—and a man who is and another student of church saw me as a CIA agent, another friend has said. This is thin, and painful evidence, but reinforces my sense of the conservative and pro KMT stance of this church.

#### **Section IV.6. The Pro-ROC Government Zone: The Assembly Hall**

##### **Church/the Difang Huei (the Local Church)**

On Taiwan, the English Plymouth Brethren movement, or more precisely a mainland Chinese-developed variant of the Brethren movement was planted by Witness Lee. Lee was the most powerful and determined and well-organized of the lieutenants of Watchman Nee. Nee, a man who studied the Brethren movement in its home base in England was the founder of what became known as the Assembly Hall Church or the “local church” (Difanghuei).<sup>15</sup>

The Church was founded in China in the 1920s and developed its own modes of organization and its own take on theology using the Brethren movement as a model, but not aligning itself to any one western church. Nee was successful in planting churches and holding on the 'local ideal even as the church expanded its membership. Fred shows us in his first substantive chapter that he has been able to develop an outline of development of the church overtime but could not probe deeper. Thus what we do have is based on his use of Watchman Nee's own narrative and other forms of data, but there are no outsider and more critical portraits and thus we see the church as its leaders wanted us to see it. I encountered this same wall of doubt and quality of guardedness when I tried to obtain data in the 1980s. Church works on theology and on Local Church analysis the books of the bible area extensive. What I do remember is that the church press was by the 1980s and a large scale operation. When I visited it again in early June of 2011, I learned how much bigger it had become—and it had to do so to meet the needs of a larger body of followers. What I did not obtain, as others may have , was access to archives and publications of the Assembly Hall's older publications. The church kept the outsider at arm's length and Morris Aaron Fred suggests this in his dissertation. The access to materials one had when one studied the True Jesus Church was very different. Here one could obtain rich materials and could thus develop a more detailed picture of church history. <sup>16</sup>



Fred did gain that access and thus his dissertations takes us step by step through aspects of the AHC from its often tangled history, through its organizational schemas to the nature and dynamics of the church's theology to the details of its church services. I made use of his work in studying the church in the 1980s and returned to it for a deeper reading in 2011 when working on this paper. What I have seen is how the church has changed , in some dramatic ways over the intervening years. That change can be seen most starkly in the nature and the scope of the Sunday service held at AHC headquarters in Taiwan.

For purposes of comparison, I will discuss one such service I attended in the 1980s and another I attended in early June of 2011. The difference between each of these services, in nature and scale, is quite dramatic.

The service I went to in the 1980s was held in a middle sized room at the church's headquarters. There were 20 to 30 people in attendance and the style was fluid and open ended rather than very formal with each stage carefully choreographed for maximum effect. I will state here that I see church service or services at Jewish synagogue or at a Buddhist temple as religious performances, with each leader and each more experienced believer/congregant fully aware of how the ritual/performance is meant to unfold. What I can see here is that over the intervening year, most probably because the very size of AHC membership has increased substantially, changes from between each of these two services were

dramatic. The 1980 service resembled what I remember seeing and experiencing in a Society of Friends (Quaker) service in the United States. It was really free-form and after some initial comments by an elder, there was silence until someone felt the power of the spirit and then spoke describing what he or she was feeling or why each person was there that day and what that person hoped to take and was taking from the service/gathering/ meeting of somewhat kindred souls. There was a subtle feeling of power in the room, but it is difficult to neatly and easily explain.

What I saw was different from what had gone on a typical Southern Baptist service or Catholic service, such as the mass I attended at the Maryknoll Chapterhouse or the Sunday worship service held at the Ghi Khang PCT Church just north of Xinyi Dong Lu that I described in my section on the Presbyterians. I was entering a different realm of religiosity in which the force of Holy Spirit acting on the members was there to be witnessed, if not understood by an outsider

I believe that one important way of understanding any church—or any religious body that holds formal services or ceremonies is to simply attend that religious event. Churches on Taiwan have been usually welcoming to strangers and this was the case in the 1980s and again in June of 2012. My June 2011 visit was on a Sunday and what I saw was very different from what I had seen in the 1980s.

The services were no longer held in a modest sized room. They were held in a very large room on the second floor in the Assembly Hall administrative center/bookstore that seated about 250 to 300 and that had standing room for another fifty or so more. On that Sunday the meeting room was filled to capacity. It was also set up so that all in the room could see and hear the speaker even though were not in the line of sight of the podium. Preaching was at the heart of the service that day and it was, as it turned out a very carefully organized event. There was some singing of hymns but preaching and messages about the work of the church center stage. During the last forty minutes of a two hour long service members gave witness to the nature of their spiritual lives and of the impact of church in what they were becoming. A film on the large scale activities was also presented. That film and the evidence of the witnesses gave me the impression of how much this church had grown on Taiwan and in the wider world. While many churches had reach a certain growth level and stayed there, this church continued to gain members and had also been able to expand in the west.

I did meet a few members and there seem to be a mixture of Waishenren and Bendiren. The person I talked to most was a Mainlander and a scientist and security specialist, a man in his sixties, who had been educated on Taiwan and who had been in the ROC Army. He had recently become a member of the *difanghuei* and had been convinced by his family to do so. What he said—what he gave witness to

—was that he felt the need for something spiritual in his life and he rejected the traditional Taiwanese faiths. He enjoyed being in the local church and was studying its doctrines. It was a very useful meeting for I was able to see the process of this large congregation's worship service and then got a sense of why this one, well educated man had joined it.

Witness Li, the man who took over the church established its presence in Los Angeles before going to Taiwan to direct the development of church whose members relocated themselves, realizing that their home church and its leader, Watchman Nee would be under attack in the PRC . The new regime was a hostile to most church especially the more independent—and sect --like indigenous churches. By remaining behind, the Assembly Hall's founder realized he was in danger and , met his death some years later. By founding a church in the western United States, Li had created a base for what would become an expanded church community in the decade that followed. However, as we shall see, in the next section, by entering the crowded and competitive American Christian community, this Indigenous Chinese church opened itself up to criticism by American evangelical watch dog groups who saw this new arrival as heretical in some of its major doctrines and wrote about this in its publications and on its website

Given its mainland roots and the fact that the main church and administrative/publication center in Taipei suggest that this church is a pro-KMT ,

pro-government church. Discussions that I had with some of the members reinforced my sense during my visit suggest that this pro-KMT stance is correct. It is comfortable with the status quo and realized that the state must be supported if Taiwan is to remain viable and ever more connected to the PRC—with qualifications. What one also sees when one studies the local churches in the power of the house churches in China, churches that do resemble and are probably related to the Assembly Hall Church on Taiwan. This underground evangelism has gone on for a long time—and was even covered on American TV in the 1990s. Thus it pays for this increasingly powerful church to strengthen its links /support for the KMT as it moves ahead in its various evangelical campaigns in China and in The United States.

### **Section V.1. Defining the Neutral Church Zone**

#### **Section. V. 2. The Neutral Church Zone: The Methodist Church**

The Methodist movement was developed by the brothers Wellesley as a middle class challenge to and a reform of the Anglican Church. The Anglican's were seen by the rising working and middle classes an ecclesiastical monopoly that defended the power, on local and regional and national levels, of the aristocratic land-holding elites. The Methodist church was a "low church" reform that made put Anglican forms of religiosity more comprehensible and comfortable to a larger number of the working poor and the rising urban and small town bourgeoisie.

Methodism came to Taiwan in 1953 and was able to plant congregations and involve them-selves in evangelism, church planting and related forms of church work in the major cities along Taiwan's west coast. Missionaries involved themselves working with other churches in summer camp and bible school sites on Yangminshan. The most substantial of Methodist church of that early period church was built on a site at 113Xinsheng Nan Lu, section 1. It is the Wesley Church and it had space for one thousand congregants.

In 2003, the Methodist Church celebrated its fiftieth anniversary in Taiwan. A short article by Lin Yiying spelled out the history of the church and what it was like in that moment of time, March 8, 2003. Missionaries representing the United Methodist church began their work in 1953 with ninety two mainlanders who had migrated to Taiwan. The work of establish the denomination's presence and building a community of churches continued to 1972. This was seen by Lin as the first period of its development. During the second period that began that same year and ended in 1986, the Chinese members of the church began to take control and the missionaries began to limit their work and remove their own mechanisms of governance. The final period, from 1986 to 2003 and beyond is that of a Taiwan based and Taiwanese mainlander church that is independent of American Methodist control. Ties with the larger Methodist world remain in place much in the fashion of the PCT's own connections to the United States and the WCC.

In 2003 there were thirty six congregations of Methodists and the church ran the Dongwu Seminary to train its own ministers, teachers and lay workers. The <sup>17</sup>total number of congregants stood at three thousand. In its modest way, the Methodist Church, as an independent, but no indigenous church entity, may be considered a success, but given the plateau of church growth in the 1970s, it is probably not as large as the missionaries and their Taiwanese mainlander brethren would have hoped.<sup>18</sup>

The Wesley Methodist Church lies north of the Church Row area that was to be found on Xinsheng Nan Lu south of Xinyi Lu and across from the Taida Campus. It remains an important center to this day I got to know about its activities in the earliest months of my research on Taiwanese Christianity. By luck or fate I lived on a street, Linyijye that lay near that Methodist church and was but a few blocks away from the complex that housed the largest of the True Jesus Church in Taipei.

What I have read and seen when I did visit the church in the 1980s and at other times in the 1990s and 2000's suggest that it is not involved in directly supporting the government or attacking. It may be because it is relatively small in size and its concerned, as many Methodist churches, are for societal, as well as, religious issues. I must add that while this is a major American denomination, its

presence on Taiwan seems it seems limited and this may account for its low profile and the difficulty to understand just where it stands.

### **Section V. The Non-involved Churches: The Church of the Latter Day Saints**

The Mormons present the United States and Taiwan with a host of challenges and problems for they are a religion unlike any other. They seem to be Christian and do use a number of classic Christian texts but they also introduce a body of their own texts that are of deeply questionable origin. Their theological concepts are again alien to mainstream and evangelical forms of Christianity, as a wide range of scholars stated in a New York Times article published on Sunday, January 15, 2012. When one looks at their organizational patterns and their perception of what a faith believing and practicing Mormon is like, one also finds patterns and practice that make them seem like a society removed from anything resembling the American mainstream. In this regard they have patterns of behavior and dress closer to those of the Haredi, the Ultra-Orthodox Jews who by their own set of practices and their attempt to force their values and modes of life on the other 90% of Israeli Jews and the Modern Orthodox, Conservative and Reform Jews who live in neighborhoods in the New York suburbs that they are invading and transforming into 17<sup>th</sup> century Poland. I would add that a New York Times article again on January 15, discussed the deep rift in the culture of Israel created by the rise of a Zealot faction of Haredi. Mormons and Haredi seem to be the



cutting edge of a new and bizarre trend in world religiosity. A similar article on the growing rift in the American Jewish community between Hardi and the other more mainstream and American –society-friendly forms of Judaism appeared a week before that one in *The Jewish Weekly*, the major voice of metropolitan New York’s large and complex Jewish community.

Mormons on Taiwan are like Mormons in their core areas in Utah and anywhere else they have settled and colonize. They bring their architectural style, a seemingly “Americanized” cultural style, and American diet (minus tea, coffee or Coca Cola and Pepsi) their modes of dress—down to the sacred underwear—and their aggressive missionizing style with them recreating a little piece of the holy space of Temple Square in Salt Lake City where ever they go.<sup>19</sup>

When we attempt to gauge their political perspective, we see a church that is careful and wary in its relationship with other churches and the larger world. This is a result of the long and acrimonious record of the LDS’s problems attempt to gain acceptance as a denomination in the United States. Even today, with a Mormon running for the presidency of the United States Mormons take a low key role. They are a stealth religion with increasing political and economic power but don’t want to highlight themselves. Yet in Salt Lake City and in Taipei they build the gaudiest and largest church complexes. The Taipei center has the flavor of Foguan Shan—bold and brassy and anything but subtle. It seems that to get away

with this act of architectural *chutzpah* it has to support the KMT state and does so. Furthermore it is building bridges to the Roman Catholic Church, another major supporter of the KMT, at least the central RCC organization does. That is important in making itself for acceptable to the population of Taipei if not other populations in other areas of Taiwan.

### **Section VI. 1. Defining the Wary and Antagonistic Zone**

The final part of the spectrum , focuses on the churches that have seen the KMT state as a threat to the majority of Taiwanese and that has treated them for most of fifty years as second class citizens. These churches have thus done battle with the government and have thus been attacked in a variety of ways by the KMT state.

### **Section VI. 2, The Wary and an Antagonistic Zone: The Presbyterian Church on Taiwan**

Over the course of this article, I have suggested and spelled out, in outline form, PCT history and its role in Taiwanese life from the early 1860s to the present. We will now see how it developed in the years after the lifting of Martial Law in 1987.

When one looks at the history of the PCT writ large one sees that from its founding on “Formosa,” the Presbyterian mission –and later, the Taiwanese –run Presbyterian Church had focused on building up—through aggressive and

sometimes unusual-modes of evangelism, and , once that “flock” had be taken in and organize, then meeting the needs of its the two populations of distinct and often antagonistic body of members—the Taiwanese and yuanzhumin. The core church bodies—the synod, in the south in Tainan, and in the north in Tamsui and the Taibei Basin, set up churches, western-styled schools, hospitals and clinics and seminaries and by the 1980s there were such social-work related, information-related, educational, medical and church related services in key areas throughout the island of Taiwan.

The educational effort, both secular and religious, was central to the PCT agenda and this has continued from the late 1980s to the present (2012). The Tainan Synod had paved the way in education and continues to do so. The middle school/high school/junior college located on a large and impressive campus in a busy neighborhood near central Tainan demonstrates this, as I saw first-hand in early June of 2011. I was paying a visit to an old friend and one of the “grand old men” of the PCT, Pastor John Tin, a witness to the 2-28 tragedy—and its effects on Taiwan and on the PCT. He was now in his nineties, a pastor, scholar and activist. He remained active monitoring human rights-related issues from his office on the Tainan school campus. He has been deeply involved in the PCT struggle against the KMT state and I see his life and work encompassing much of the PCT history

since the Retrocession. I must add that it has been my honor and my great joy to know him and learn from him since the early 1980s.

The seminary of the PCT in Tainan, the southern seminary, is an impressive and classic piece of property that goes back to the 1860s and 1870s, the decades the PCT mission established its presence on the island. It contains a school, a small guesthouse/museum, the church's publishing house, a chapel, classrooms and an administration center and one knew that the local authorities were monitoring all westerners and Taiwanese who went there after the KMT-PCT battles of the 1970s and early to mid 1980s.<sup>20</sup> When I have been there in the 1980s , the 1990s , and in the 2000s I had a deep sense of visiting holy space that was also a vital and living educational/ecclesiastical and socially oriented body. It was here I met and had long conversations with Pastor Xiao, who later served at the "god box" –the Interchurch Center on that abuts the Union Theological Seminary in NY's Upper West Side and Barnard College/Columbia University. Pastor Xiao's daughter is the famous DPP leader Xiao Bhi Khim, a member of the Chen Administration and a woman still active in the DPP this election year. I have mentioned this to show just how close the PCT is to the DPP.

The Presbyterians also have a secular school system and a seminary in the territory of the Northern Synod. The grand old school based in Tamsui is the Tam

Kang Middle School/high school and it served, as had the school complex in Tainan to meet the needs of the PCT members and others who had been denied middle school and high school by the Japanese. The most famous graduate of this school is Li Denghuei, the former KMT President of Taiwan from 1988 until 2000. As we know, Li did convert to Presbyterian Christianity and evidence of his faith—as well as his adoption of or integration of Zen ideas—a result of his years as a college student and a member of the Japanese Army --can be found in some of his speeches and writings.

The PCT also has the second of its three seminaries in the Taipei area. The Taiwan Theological College and Seminary (hereafter TTCS) is located halfway up Yangmingshan. It is a college/seminary with a long history as the PCT center for theological education for the North Synod. The campus is a beautiful, very classical one that is laid out in tiers there is a library, a chapel, and administration building with offices for the college president and faculty, a number of think tanks and buildings that house faculty and their families and the college's students. After spend time in crowded Taipei, it was a great pleasure to take the bus up the great mountain that guards the city and breathe the fresher air while one takes in the trees and lush greenery, all but missing in the Taipei that lies below.

The PCT has worked hard to maintain its links with the World Council of Churches and the central organizations of the Presbyterian Churches of the UK,

Canada and the United States and that cosmopolitan flavor can be found when meeting the members of the faculty. The core of instructors is Taiwanese and come from families within the church. While many did their primary, secondary and college/university educations in Taiwan and some of their theological training on the island in the Taiwan Theological College and Seminary and the Tainan Theological Seminary, many went to the United States, to the UK or Western Europe. There were such schools as Princeton mentioned by the faculty I met in early June of 2011 as well as Heidelberg, as Oxford and the University of Edinburgh. There are also westerners on the faculty. It was made clear to me that most were, like their Taiwanese comrades/faculty mates from major universities in the United State or from Western Europe or from some of the grand old colleges and universities in various parts of the UK. The setting of this small, but quite beautiful theological center was bucolic and felt like being in the quiet, low energy countryside, but its faculty were clearly fueled by hi-octane educations and intellectual ambitions. Given what I learned of these individuals and their scholarship, they would fit in at any major university or elite college anywhere in the western world or in the major centers of East Asia or the Commonwealth powers of New Zealand or Australia.

The TTCS faculty and administrators, over time, have developed a strong and rounded education for its would-be pastors, seminary and church

administrators of specialists in PCT-run outreach centers. The student body seems relatively small but dedicated and they will become, in time the leaders of this powerful force for good on Taiwan.

One can get the favor of life at the TTCS by reading, as I have, issues of the *Taiwan Shenxueyuan* (Taiwan Theological College and Seminary) *newsletter*. I have in hand issues 134 to 138 and these cover the period from April, 2008 to November 2009. These give me much of the arc of the school year and thus flavor of what the school is like as defined by its Principal, its faculty, and its students. This a well written and carefully produced English language publication has opened up, for me at least, an important and most useful window to this major PCT educational center, with its strong library facilities and its provocatively-name think tanks. Each issue I read began by a comment or thought piece from the colleges Principal, Lin Hong-hsin, his colleague, and acting Principal, Tsai Ling Chen. They are strong pieces and show both a depth of knowledge of the larger world and real sense how faith can define who people are.

Many of the other articles provide profiles of the Taiwan TTCS faculty, both Taiwanese and western and newcomers and old hands. One can see the variety and one can get to know these people through their profiles, written in either first person or third person. There are also articles on new initiatives and on yearly

classroom events and activities. One major piece spelled out the opening and dedication of a downtown Taipei campus of the TTCS. This was an important expansion of the college/seminary and provided easier access for those living in the urban space and not the mountain home that was the TTCS main campus. There are three departments and programs located at the downtown Taipei facility. They are the Department of Theology, the Department of Church and Society, and the Urban Mission Center. I think, as a student of PCT development that this is a very good move and that the departments located in the urban center are designed to meet the need of outreach to city's population and also put this faculty within a short distance by MRT of the PCT headquarters near Taida, and a few blocks for two MRT Red Line Stations (or subway stops, a New Yorker might say). I don't think it is much of a stretch to say that in this case we see the PCT following the example of Tamkang University which had its main campus in Tamsui and a city campus of near the Yunkong Jye area that faces the Mormon complex and the old Vatican Apostolica. I must add that the Vatican does not formally recognize the ROC and thus the Taiwan-based RCC, but that is another long and sad story.

I did do things in 2011 that I do each year that I am in Taiwan. I visited the headquarters of the PCT and did go to my church about a mile away and north on Xinsheng Nan Lu.. At the PCT head quarters, I interviewed various church official and staff, Taiwanese and western and got their sense of what was going on in a set



of conversations and interviews. It has become a ritual of sorts for me since I first learned about the PCT in 1979 and got to know its leaders, its administrators, its pastors and a number of its members. I have become its western chronicler of sorts and thus visit central offices. It is one of my favorite places in all of Taipei.

The Sunday before that visit to the PCT HQ I went to services at my home church in Taiwan. The small, but important church is located off Xinyi Lu and it had been the home of Lin Yixiong, the lawyer and , the DPP leader who had been a major defendant in the Gaxiong Incident Trial (the incident was in December of 1979) of 1980. Counselor Lin's mother-in-law and twin daughters were murdered in a quite brutal fashion in the spring of 1980 as the trials related to that important clash between the Dangwai and the thugs put in place by the Jiang Jinguo-led government were taking place. The criminals are yet to be arrested and put on trial, and it is now thirty-one-years later. This church the Ghi khang Church is a martyr's church that gives it a very special place in the PCT church community writ large. I was introduced to the church by Pastor John Tin, now in 90s; an important figure in the church that is theologian, philosopher and activist and is still involved monitor political events and sending articles out to old friends. I would add that I did see Pastor Tin at his offices on the campus the PCT's middle school. High school, junior college facility in downtown Tainan. I made the trip south and back to Taipei in one day because of the modern miracle of the new

high-speed rail system. It was, I know now, a pilgrimage to visit a man who I love and respect and see as one of the lesser known struggles of the PCT in its war of words and more with the KMT government from 1947 to the coming to power of President Li Denghui and his successor, President Chen Shuibian.

The services each Sunday are carefully spelled out and are in Taiwanese. Even without the mastery of the language, I can follow the service, step by step with the program that is given out and then sing the hymns that are in the Romanized *Taiwanhua* that the Presbyterian missionaries first developed when they worked in Xiamen in the middle years of the 19<sup>th</sup> century. I can also follow the reading of the biblical text. And having spent about twenty seven years attending these services, I have a good sense of what is taking place and what messages and words of faith are given to the congregants. I have met with them over the years and each time meet new people and see old friends One is Joyce Chen, an administrator at the PCT HQ and a woman who, with Pastor Gao Junming, then the leader of the church, helped to hide the Dangwai leader, Shi Mingde. As a result of this she was arrested with Pastor Gao and spent years in an ROC prison, as did her friend and boss. Like Pastor Gao, and John Tin, who did introduce me to the church the year it opened in 1984, Joyce is one of Taiwan's lesser known heroes.

I find the Sunday worship service meaningful and enjoy the whole gestalt of the event and the lunch that is served afterward. I go as an act of admiration and respect for this church and its members and the PCT, as an institution, and feel connected to the Presbyterians and their long history and their strong advocacy of Taiwanese identity and selfhood. Can an observer and chronicler/historian be an advocate as well? I would answer yes. I may be passing over some invisible yellow line here (like the ones in TV professional football broadcasts--Go NY Giants in Super-bowl, 2012), but will take the risk. It is what I see that I must do.

We must all make choices and mine is to support the PCT and its wide-ranging efforts in helping the people of Taiwan and their complex society.

### **Section VI.3. The Wary and an Antagonistic Zone: the True Jesus Church**

Itinerant American evangelists who came out the first wave of the Midwestern and West coast-based Pentecostal/Charismatic movement, such as Amy Semple McPherson, later the founder the Foursquare Gospel Church, an institution that can be seen as a proto –mega-church, went to China during the early decades of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. A number of Chinese who heard these missionaries preach founded their own indigenous charismatic/Pentecostal styled

churches. The largest and most famous of these is the True Jesus Church, a church that began in Shandong, grew and spread down the China coast to Fujian. In the early 1920s, members of that Fujian branch crossed the Taiwan Strait and found a branch and later branches of the True Jesus church. Its members based the church not in Japanese dominated Taipei, the capital of their colony, but in the smaller the Taiwanese-dominated city of Taizhong.

As luck would have it that city was and remains the home of the mission and the seminary of the Holiness Church. Thus two churches founded as result of the Methodist revivals came into direct confrontation with each other. By the 1980s, it the available statistic made it clear which church had won the war for converts. It was the True Jesus Church.

The True Jesus Church found a home in Taiwan in the 1920s . It began to expand during the Japanese period and once the war was over has continued to spread to most corners of the island The Wikipedia article on the TJC, written, I assume by TJC members and historians of the church, gives the reader a clear idea of its progress and the nature of its activities, though in all too brief a fashion. Present day scholars such as your author, the historian Mellissa Inouye, the pastor/theologian, David A. Reed, the church historian, Gordon Melton and the sociologist have all done important work on the church within their respective disciplines. Its major religious center is Taizong and, it is fair to say, it is the

dominant church and most active church in that city. It also has important centers in Taipei and has congregations throughout the island.

The TJC has defined its own vision of Christianity over the years since the mid 1910s and its own distinctive modes holding formal services and making use of the patterns of glossolalia. A typical service in Taipei or Taizhong, the two sites I visited and did fieldwork in, separates men from women—more or less in the style of Modern Orthodox Jews, and makes good use of a mixture of preaching (in Taiwanese and Mandarin), singing of hymns, and “speaking in tongues”. The major service is held during the day on Saturday—the Jewish Shabbat. Services are also held each evening, though the number of members in attendance is far smaller. I have been to ten gospel meetings in the United States and to services held by Black churches as well and the power and emotion of these services mirrors what I have seen in the True Jesus service and the services held by the Assembly Hall churches as well. One feels the depth of feeling and the sense of pure spiritual joy—even to this skeptical—and reform Jewish observer.

The church has grown on Taiwan and well beyond Taiwan’s borders. It now has begun to play a role in the life of people in the PRC and among Chinese communities in America and beyond. I will explore this process of expansion and TJC outreach in my final section.

## **Section VI.4. The Wary and an Antagonistic Zone: The New Testament**

### **Church**

A much smaller church had its roots in the radical and charismatic theology of a Shanghai singer who moved to Hong Kong after the victory of the CCP. This was the New Testament Church and its Sabbatarian worship and Gifts of the Holy spirit/Speaking in Tongues, among other things make similar in kind, if not in politics with its older sister church, the True Jesus Church. It too has a conservative and exclusivist philosophy as did the TJC. However, rather than work with the state or, at least stay within the law, the NTC saw itself as above the law and above all man created governments and only obey what they saw to be god's law.

The church had begun in the mind of a popular singer who had moved from Shanghai to Hong Kong and there founded a church that was small and exclusivist and develop a quasi Old Testament vision that did center, as most conventional Christian churches did on the person of Jesus. Like the TJC, the new church stressed speaking in tongues and also in the absolute power and the founder or her successor. As I have spelled out in a long article on the NTC, the church came to Taiwan under its second leader, Elijah Hong and declared that it was building a new Mount Zion in yuanzhumin lands east of Tainan County. There he and his followers built a community and orchards and grew and processed fruit to support

themselves. They also preached against the KMT state and damned its leaders in the harshest terms possible. I was there at a long, long, long Shabbat service and heard the violent rhetoric that called upon God/Yahweh to bring death to the members of the Jiang family. The government tried to drive them off of their mountain until an Academia based sociologist (and old friend), Zhu Haiyuan served as intermediary between the Elijah Hong's church and the ROC government. The conflict was ended, but not the NTC's rhetoric and fiery mode of preaching.

What I saw in my weekend with the NTC on Mount Zion and what I read in the church's literature was clear evidence that this was cult, whose leader was a servant and prophet of God and whose interpretation of both Testaments was only correct one. All other churches were inferior and were seen as enemies of this one true church. The problem was that to a nation with a small Christian population that took threats against its government seriously, all Christian churches were now a seen as a threat and quiet of real backlash against all churches took place. I was attending the Taiwan Missionary Fellowship meeting that year and discussed the impact that the NTC and its radical stance and ongoing battle with the state was having, and most pastors there voice their concern about the danger this radical and very angry church did pose to their own network of churches and church-run organizations.

The church has not grown and remains small and outside even the indigenous Charismatic main-stream. However, like those other indigenous Taiwanese churches , it has found an audience and new members in Chinese and Taiwanese churches in the United States. For me, as student of this church this American(and New York City) connection proved very valuable. It was the Queens, NY branch of the church that gave me the literature I needed to learn about the NTC and begin to understand its doctrine—and it was this NYC branch that told the NTC members on Mount Zion that I was coming to Taiwan to learn about and write about their besieged church in the winter of 1993. Whatever their feelings about the KMT state, they were a welcoming group of people and excellent hosts: It was because of that kindness I was able to meet them on their holy ground, hear their prophet speak and come to understand what this fascinating, if difficult, religious body the New Testament Church really was.<sup>21</sup>

What is clear about the NTC is that its very existence is based on antagonism and conflict with the KMT state. It sees itself as the only real authority and all others are false. This led to the battles it fought and often lost in the 1980s and to sense of a church apart from and hostile to its host society that I found when I visited the church headquarters in Mt. Zion in December of 1990, just before I gave a paper on that church at a conference in Taipei.



## **Section VI. 5. The Wary and Antagonistic Zone: the Maryknollers**

One such key Roman Catholic Church group of missionaries that did not support the KMT like the Catholic hierarchy –the Arch-Dioecese, and the other Catholic missionary orders on Taiwan such as the Jesuits did were the Maryknollers--the Catholic Mission Society in America. This order/society was the first American missionary order and it was founded in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. For most of its history it was located in Lakehurst, New Jersey but in the 1950's it moved to land in the town of Ossining in the western part of New York State's Westchester County in the Hudson River Valley. Here it remains to this day.

The central building is a vast and impressive structure that seems to blend Western and Asian styles of architecture. That building contains administrative office, a substantial library, primarily devoted to Asian books and a film archive as well. Nearby are to be found the housing facilities for the men and women who serve in the order. I know the site well and have made good use of its libraries over the decades. My working relationship with Marknoll extended to Taiwan as well. I have also stayed at the Maryknoll Chapterhouse in Taizhong over the years, and used it as base when studying the other major churches who had headquarters in Taizhong, the Holiness Church and the True Jesus Church.

I have also been able and visited other sites. The most important of these, is a church run by two Maryknoll priests that was located in a town in the central mountains east of Taizhong. That church/mission served the needs of the Yuanzhumin community nearby, in the heart of Taiwan's tea growing area.

I felt at home at Maryknoll in the United States and on Taiwan and got to know the men who served it and the nature of the order's role and presence on Taiwan during the critical years of the 1970s and after. Many of those Maryknoll priests (shenfu) that I met and worked with embraced a form of Social Gospel and/or Liberation Theology which made these individuals sensitive to the belief system and the political/human rights efforts of the Presbyterian Church on Taiwan and also with the Taizhong-based True Jesus Church, an indigenous church that usually was wary of Western churches. The TJC was one of the largest churches on the island and worked among both the Taiwanese and the Yuanzhumin communities. This share work and feelings of loyalty to the people of Taiwan that evolved quietly and under the radar between Catholics, Presbyterians and True Jesus leaders provided common ground that was sufficient to produce a quiet alliance of sorts in the battle with what members of all three Christian organizations considered an oppressive, and sometimes violent and dangerous, KMT dominated state structure.

What I have suggested here is that the Maryknoll order was in conflict with the KMT state . We see this most clearly in the months before and after the Gaoxiong Incident of December 10, 1979. This incident was a clash between the Dangwai/Melidao activists and thugs hired by the KMT that took during a large political demonstration held in front of the Gaoxiong Railroad station after a year of smaller KMT/Dangwai demonstrations. Key Maryknoll priests and nuns supported the Dangwai and the anti-KMT effort and suffered for it by expulsion from Taiwan. That angry and rebellious spirit and an anti-totalitarian outlook continued to be expressed by Maryknollers I met during my stays in Taizhong in the 1980s and 1990s. That feeling of solidarity with the Taiwanese people also led to the defacto alliance of the PCT, the Maryknollers and the TJC that I made mention and was a quiet , but powerful dynamic in the church community that other more passive or pro-state church leaders feared and detested and stated as such during my interviews with them over the course of the 1980s, the decade of rapid Taiwanese democratization.

## Conclusions

When we look at the Christian Community in Modern Taiwan, we see a great range of churches, one that reflects the western missionary invasion that swept through Taiwan in distinctive waves since the 1600s. Taiwan, like China was a

target of evangelism and of the what must be called ( with its Orietalist biases) the civilizing mission of Western centered Christianity. (start)

---

<sup>1</sup> See Jonathan Spence, *God's Chinese Son.....*See also Murray A. Rubinstein, *The Origins of the Anglo-American Missionary Enterprise in China* (New Jersey: Scarecrow Press, 1996)) 1996.

---

<sup>2</sup> Spanish missionaries settled into Jilong and Tamsui in 1626 and develop a presence there among *yuanzhumin* living in the area for a decade or so. Their arch rivals, the VOC and its allies, missionaries of the Dutch Reformed (Calvinist) church that had begun work among the Fujian immigrants working with the Dutch in what Andrade has called co-colonization as well as among Plains Aborigine from southern Taiwan. The Dutch hated the Spanish and were in the midst of a long, many-decade-long war for complete liberation from Spain's control. Taiwan became another theater in that war that rage around the world. The Dutch, well armed and allied with Yuanzhumin, carried on a campaign against the Catholic invaders, as they saw them, and won the mini-war handily. The Dutch lost their own control of the island in the 1660s after a long battle and siege by the forces of the Han-Japanese warlord, Koxinga who drove the Dutch back to the base Batavia and with the , the Dutch Reformed missionaries who had begun, one a number of levels, the westernization of the tribal peoples. Certain elements of this civilizing project had worked. More than a century later, as the anthropologist Myron Cohen has shown us in his work on Taiwanese contracts in Qing Taiwan, contracts written by the aborigines in southern Taiwan used both a Romanized script and Chinese characters.

3

The (Roman Catholic) Church on Taiwan, ROC: Brief History (Taipei, 2009) 19. See also Hollington Tong, *Christianity on Taiwan: A History*, cpt. 3, cpt. 29, cpt.30.

<sup>4</sup> Let me step back here and state that there were Jesuits and there were Jesuits. My professor at St. Johns University (New York) in the 1960s, Father Thomas Berry (the uncle of Elizabeth Berry, a major figure in 15<sup>th</sup> and 16<sup>th</sup> century Japanese history and a former president of the Association of Asian Studies) and , for example, was a scholar of Chinese religion and a devoted friend of that major figure in Catholic life Teilhard DeJardin. Father DeJardin was an archaeologist who studied the Beijing man and later became a philosopher/theologist of the future in his wonderful and much criticized book the *Phenomenon of Man*. At the Tian Center, for example, there existed a research center run by a Belgian priest, father Benoit Vermander, a Jesuit, who represented a very different strain of Catholicism. He was from the great Belgian university of Louvegne and gathered around him young scholars such as Elise Devito and Ann Heylen who were the very opposite of my conservative Jesuit colleague at the Furen History Department.

<sup>5</sup> I must add would that I lived near this area for many years further north on Xincheng Nan Lu and Xinyi Lu, first an old and cheap hotel, the International House, served for western students and visiting scholars—such as Jerry Dennerline, Harry Lamely, and a host of others, as well as some of the weirdest American and British expatriates one could ever meet. It was near what was then the main Taipei exhibition center. It was also near the remains of an old Japanese era rat-warren of old homes, small stores and *minjian* temples and was great fun to wander through. When that complex closed and the entire area destroyed to make room for the new and much needed park complex, I discovered and moved to the OK Guest House, a modest hotel that was located a little further up and just west off Xincheng Nanlu and close to Xinyi Lu and its many stores and wonderful Storefront Buddhist temple.. This area was my home area for more than a two decade and its location made my study of the Christian community very convenient and very pleasant for it meant a short bus ride on the Ling Nan—the Zero South bus that took me

---

south on Xinsheng Nan Lu. Forgive me for reminiscing, but I wanted to share this small world that I came to know and was identified with by other friends and fellow scholars and with you, my readers .

<sup>6</sup>See *The 150<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Celebration of the Catholic Evangelization of Taiwan (1859-2009)* (Taipei: RCC Publishing House, 2010).

When look at the 150<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Volume, we see that the book is, in its longest section divided into sections that cover in some detail the history of and some of the characteristics of the Taipei Archdiocese and each of the diocese. The history of each of these administrative units is unique as these sections of anniversary volume show us. A more general timeline/chronicle of Taiwan RCC history is provided by the Church in “Taiwan, Roc: Brief History”<sup>6</sup> and by making use of both publications one can get a good idea of how the church did develop over the last sixty five years. Hollington Tong’s book also provides useful information on the years from 1859 to 1961 and provides us with valuable and clearly spelled out narrative of these crucial earlier periods and years.

He begins not with history , however, but with the present—and here I mean the grand ceremony that marked the anniversary. This was held at the grand cathedral in Taipei and brought together the archbishop, the bishops of each diocese, the parish priests who were on the ground level, and members of the missionary orders of priests and nuns who worked in the various institutions that the individual orders or combinations of orders ran. The pictures are ablaze with the colors of the robes and headgear that are akin the US Marine Corps formal Dress Blues and they capture the sheer size and magnificence that is found only in a grand Catholic cathedral (and in some Anglican ones as well). The RCC leaders here and elsewhere know that at essence high church religion is a show given in as large and glorious a theater as possible. The larger scene is caught in the DVD’s that accompany the Anniversary Volume and making for a richer sense of the event and of the sheer glory of the RCC on Taiwan. For an outsider such your author, this visit or observation and participation in such services and rites is part of the fun of doing work on large scale religious bodies. No I do not accept the wafer and the wine—the Body and the Blood. That for me is a step too far. Only a synagogue like those found on NY’s fifth avenue or in Jerusalem can be any match for what I saw in the Catholic churches I visited Taipei and elsewhere...and no other form religious can compare in terms of the music one hears at such an RCC site. Paris on a Christmas week at various grand cathedrals comes to mind.

<sup>7</sup> See “Catholic Church: Profile, p. 12.” This a handout of four pages I was given by a nun who worked at the information office of the Taipei Archdiocese administrative center in southeastern section Taipei city in early June of 2011. To one outside the Church like me, it is a very useful publication.

---

<sup>8</sup> See Richard Madsen, “The Spectacular Growth and Precipitous Decline of the Catholic Church in Taiwan”

<sup>9</sup> See Timothy Lin, biography in Wikipedia, the online encyclopedia. This a useful and relatively detailed portrait of this important figure in the Chinese and Taiwanese church and , though some editing is needed it contains important data , but data tht suggests the evangelical leanings of its author.

<sup>10</sup> “China Evangelical Seminary of Taiwan Names Peter K. Chow New President” in *The Gospel Herald*, (Global Gospel News Service) January 23, 2011.

<sup>11</sup> Alan Swanson:

*Mainline Versus Independent Church* (Pasadena, CA: William Carey Library, 1970) a

*The Church on Taiwan: Profile 1980* (Pasadena, CA: William Carey Library, 1981).

*Mending the Nets* (Pasadena: William Carey Press, 1986)

<sup>12</sup> I must add here that I learned something of the power of this Korean Charismatic movement when I attended a meeting of the Society for Pentecostal Studies held in a bible school located near the shore community of Huntington Beach. I had become a friend of the Provost of the Fuller Theological Seminary in Pasadena, a seminary that was shifting from evangelical to Pentecostal forms of Christianity, and my friend was a Pentecostal. He was working with a Korean-American businessman who was closely allied with Paul Chou’s church and this man gave me a good sense of the nature of what Paul Chou and his mega church did. I also learned how strong the links and relationships between Korean and American evangelicals and Pentecostals were becoming. I saw this movement as an important and fascinating one and now see it as a early sign of the expansion of East Asian (here Korean) forms of independent Christianity was becoming. I shall deal with this issue of Taiwanese Christian outreach and expansionism in section three. I have mentioned here because it shows how far ahead of the curve Allan Swanson was and much he thought that East Asian forms of emotional, “Holy Spirit Driven forms of Christian might change the dynamics of church life and promote church growth on Taiwan. Here Swanson was at one—was on the same page with my American Pentecostal seminary administrator friend—and a powerful student of Latin American Pentecostal and Charismatic movements and his Korean-American player and intermediary who helped bring together Korean and American men of religious power and influence.

<sup>13</sup>My account of this research in the 1980s is spelled out in *The Protestant Community on Modern Taiwan* (1991). 95-109.

<sup>14</sup> . On the history of the Holiness Church in Taiwan see *Taiwan Holiness Church, Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia*. The major problem with this article, useful though it is , is that it contains little if any information about the Holiness Church and its history on Taiwan after 1927. Let me admit that the search for more data on this church on Taiwan has been frustrating. There is a Taiwan Holiness Church in Pasadena, California, that has some information about itself, but little has found yet about the Taiwan based Holiness Church.

---

<sup>15</sup> My account of the Assembly Hall Church/ ‘local church’ makes use of books and tracts published by the Assembly Hall Church. It also draws from data and analysis that is found in the now classic, very rich, well written and insightful UC Berkley dissertation by the anthropologist, Morris Aaron Fred. Fred concentrates on this Taiwan and Los Angeles centered church as way of understanding the “local church” movement. My presentation is also based on my fieldwork and participant observation on the church carried out in the 1980, 1990s, and again in 2011 in Taipei.

<sup>16</sup> Melissa Inouye wrote a detailed history of the TJC on the Chinese Mainland. That history remains a Harvard dissertation that is available. It is a strong and fascinating and very well written piece of church history. I have read one key chapter of that dissertation and commented on it in a panel on the TJC that was part of a conference on religion, society and economic development held in Arlington , Virginia in April of 2011.

<sup>17</sup> One further note is necessary here: the fact that the leading candidate for the Republican presidential candidate is a practicing Mormon has energized the evangelical base of the more conservative and “ Christian” Republican party and what amounts to a cultural war within the GOP seems to be looming. I would add that Liberal Democrats feel, like your author feel much the same sense of wariness and nervousness of toward Mormon candidate and this can only strengthen Obama ‘s bid for a second term. The Economist loves Romney and a call for tolerances sounds out in its latest issue, but it is, for all its brilliance, a British publication whose home nation has its own issues with religious and ethnic and class tolerance.

<sup>18</sup> See Lin Yining, “ Taiwanese Methodists Celebrate its Fiftieth Anniversary” in , Taiwan Church News, 2663, March 16, 2003.

<sup>19</sup>

<sup>20</sup> On the PCT see Rubinstein, Mission of Faith/Burden of Witness: the Presbyterian Church in the Evolution of Modern Taiwan in Clart and Jones, *Religion in Modern Taiwan* (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 2003)

<sup>21</sup> On this church see Murray A. Rubinstein,” The New Testament Church and the Taiwanese Protestant Community,” In Murray A. Rubinstein editor, *The Other Taiwan* (Armonk, New York: M. E. Sharpe, 1994), 446-473